

Migration Advisory Committee's consultation on the impact of the ending of freedom of movement on health and social care

About Camphill Scotland

Camphill Scotland is the membership organisation for the 11 Camphill communities in Scotland. Together, our members support more than 600 people with learning disabilities and other support needs, including children, young people, adults and older people. The communities are located in a variety of beautiful locations across Scotland, from Dumfries to Aberdeen. Each offers a supportive community life with personalised opportunities to find purpose and belonging through a wide range of social, cultural and work activities.

Camphill has become a global movement, since the first Camphill community was set up in 1940 at Milltimber, Aberdeenshire by Austrian Jewish refugees from the Nazis. The Camphill movement is international in its outlook with more than 119 communities now established in 27 countries around the world. Camphill in Scotland has strong international roots, and citizens from EU countries, and from other countries, make a significant contribution to the work of the Camphill communities in Scotland, and to the care and support they provide for people with learning disabilities and other support needs. By way of further background, the total number of paid staff from EU countries working and living in Camphill communities in 2021 is 173, and the total number of paid staff from non-EU countries working and living in Camphill communities in 2021 is 46. There are also currently approximately 302 international volunteers (242 international volunteers from EU countries, and 60 international volunteers from non-EU countries), in Camphill communities in Scotland providing social care and education to people with learning disabilities and with other support needs. These young people have chosen to stay and provide social care to UK citizens during the Covid-19 national health emergency, which demonstrates their dedication to, and compassion for, the people they support.

Camphill Scotland welcomes the Migration Advisory Committee's consultation which will inform the review "of adult social care and the impact the ending of freedom of movement has had on the sector". Camphill Scotland and our partners helped to secure this review. Baroness Jones tabled an Amendment to the Immigration and Social Security Co-ordination (EU Withdrawal) Bill in the House of Lords on behalf of Camphill Scotland and our partners totalling over 50 organisations across the UK. This Amendment would have required the UK Government to make arrangements for an independent evaluation of the impact of the points based immigration system upon health and social care sectors across the UK. The UK Government, in response to Amendments tabled by Lord Rosser and by Baroness Jones, confirmed it would commission the Migration Advisory Committee (MAC) to undertake this review.

The immigration health surcharge exemption

Nationals from other countries who wish to live and work in the UK are, subject to certain exceptions, required to pay the immigration health surcharge in order to access services under the NHS. Camphill Scotland and our partners welcomed the UK Government's decision to exempt health and social care staff from other countries from paying the immigration health surcharge. We are very concerned, however, that this exemption does not include international volunteers working in health and social care, and in other settings, for charities in the UK.

Camphill Scotland and our partners, totalling 52 organisations across the UK, are concerned that the UK Government's decision to exclude international volunteers from the immigration health surcharge exemption will, in the future, deter international volunteers from working as volunteers for charities in the UK in health and social care, and in other settings. This will impact upon the capacity of the Camphill communities in the UK to provide care and support, and education, to people with learning disabilities and other support needs, as well as upon the capacity of charities

across the UK in health and social care and in other settings including youth work and other services supporting young people. We are, therefore, seeking cross-party support for an Amendment at the Report Stage of the Nationality and Borders Bill in the House of Commons, which would extend the immigration health surcharge exemption to international volunteers. This will significantly reduce the costs of people from other countries seeking to volunteer with Camphill communities or other charities in the UK.

Consultation response

Camphill Scotland and our members are concerned that Brexit and the ending of freedom of movement for EU nationals, and the operation of the UK's new points based immigration system, will have a major, adverse impact upon the ability of the Camphill communities in Scotland to recruit paid staff and volunteers from EU countries, and from non-EU countries, at the levels required to guarantee their sustainability. These concerns are reflected in the responses below provided by Camphill Scotland's members to the MAC's consultation on the impact of the ending of freedom of movement upon health and social care. For ease of reference the local authority area in which each Camphill community is located is also identified.

1. Please tell us what impact Covid-19 has had on staffing levels and recruitment in the social care sector?:
Beannachar, Aberdeenshire
“Recruitment of volunteers has taken longer, and ever changing travel restrictions have made it difficult to know when we had our full quota of volunteers and that they would arrive at the time it was hoped they would arrive”.
Camphill Blair Drummond, Stirling
“During 2020, there was no obvious impact. However, during 2021, there has been a significant impact on employees: Re-evaluating their careers in Social Care and moving onto other sectors; and feeling exhausted in a role that has been so focused on restrictions and limitations due to COVID-19, and now feeling under further pressure due to vacancies and time lags in Camphill Blair Drummond being able to recruit suitable employees”.
Please also refer to Camphill Blair Drummond's answers for Questions 2 & 3 below”.
Camphill Corbenic, Perth and Kinross
“At the beginning of Covid, Camphill Corbenic experienced an influx of new staff who had lost their jobs, or who were forced to change their plans of starting full time study. Working in social care may not have been a long-term decision for these staff, but rather to ‘plug a gap’ with guaranteed employment during the height of the pandemic. These staff have since left, and returned to pursue their original plans/returned to their normal areas of work. Corbenic had made a big investment in terms of the recruitment of staff and the induction processes, training, learning and development of all new staff to then lose them a short time afterwards. Furthermore, Camphill Corbenic has been struggling to backfill these posts due to a national staff shortage”.
“The nature of care roles, whereby staff are more likely to have close contact with service users and other employees, may result in them being more likely to encounter someone who has COVID-19. This can have a direct impact with regards to time lost due to

employees being off ill with COVID-19, or due to the isolation restrictions required through track and trace etc.”

“In addition, Camphill Corbenic has examples of multiple staff and couples who share accommodation. This leads to multiple staff being absent from work when 1 household member tests positive. Absences related to COVID-19 (both positive tests and isolation for other reasons) has caused significant pressure for the community. Camphill Corbenic has been forced to use relief (or bank staff) to cover gaps, and it has found that agencies do not have staff available”.

“In addition, COVID-19 has impacted upon employees who were classed as ‘vulnerable’, and, therefore, could only work based on government guidelines. Corbenic had to adapt and to offer flexible working and home working to ensure social distancing”.

“Much higher levels of staff resignation have been experienced in the last year adding to an already challenging situation”.

Camphill School Aberdeen, Aberdeen City Council

“There have been longer UKVI VAC appointment waiting times across EU. The general delays for arrivals and isolation with COVID-19, and the new rule change on 4 October 2021 have not been helpful for vaccinated (Pfizer or AZ) volunteers from Latin American who wish to volunteer at the school”.

“More UK based residential volunteers have been joining the community this year, along with a large increase for Day Volunteering within the Young Adult Day Services (workshops, farm and garden and Young Adult HUB) from all ages”.

Loch Arthur, Dumfries and Galloway

“Loch Arthur has had sufficient numbers of applicants in 2020 and 2021, despite COVID-19 and Brexit. The community is benefitting from the fact that young people cannot travel further abroad to countries such as Australia, the USA etc. which makes coming to the UK more attractive. Loch Arthur has had a few cases of volunteers not arriving due to complications caused by COVID-19”.

Newton Dee, Aberdeen City Council

“Recruitment has taken a lot longer because of isolation requirements and cancelled flights. Costs have increased for individuals from other countries wishing to volunteer. It takes a lot of commitment for applicants wishing to work as international volunteers to make it all the way to Scotland”.

Ochil Tower School, Perth and Kinross

“Increased costs have made it more difficult to recruit volunteers”.

Simeon Care for the Elderly, Aberdeen City Council

“The reduction in applicants for nursing and care posts has had serious implications as staff are having to work extra hours to cover staffing gaps. As a result, this has been challenging for their physical and mental health. Some of the staff team were furloughed due to health reasons, which also impacted upon the staff team and residents”.

	<p>“Trained professionals are choosing not to work within care home settings due to COVID-19, extra paperwork, cleaning, national expectations and the pressure not to bring COVID-19 into work. Simeon Care for the Elderly has seen a reduction of EU applicants and nursing professionals, which would have helped to give the staff team a good balance”.</p> <p>Tigh a’ Chomainn Camphill, Aberdeen City Council</p> <p>“Tigh a’ Chomainn has had to significantly increase the number of people it engages to operate its service. This has been made harder by a lack of people able, and willing, to work in social care. It takes a minimum of two months for people coming from Europe to complete the paperwork, and to receive their visas. In other cases it can be up to 4 months. As a result, there have been extended periods where there are gaps in Tigh a’ Chomainn’s service”.</p> <p>“Costs have also escalated. The senior staffing team is also close to burnout. It is expected that all will likely leave the health and social care sector within 3 years”.</p>
<p>2.</p>	<p>What impact do you think this, and the wider implications of the EU Exit referendum will have on:</p> <p>(a)The employment of European workers in social care/within your community?</p> <p>Beannachar, Aberdeenshire</p> <p>“The route of EU volunteers to consider moving into paid positions, e.g. starting as support workers and progressing their careers over time to more senior levels is no longer an option. Though the number of staff is small (perhaps 1 person per year moving from volunteer to employment) it was significant to the organisation to have staff familiar with its service users, and provided continuity of care. There are currently 5 staff working at senior level in Beannachar who started as volunteers years ago, and through training and experience are now filling the most senior positions. The same opportunities were provided to UK and non-UK staff to progress”.</p> <p>Camphill Blair Drummond, Stirling</p> <p>“Camphill Blair Drummond has always received interest from its international volunteers to either extend their volunteering time with the community, or to remain as employees, after they have completed their one year volunteering placement. Each year on average, Camphill Blair Drummond usually extends volunteering placements to 5 volunteers, and over the last 10 years has offered positions of employment to 2 volunteers. In the last few years this interest has dropped off significantly due to the then uncertainty around the Brexit referendum, and since then due to the result”.</p> <p>“During the first year of COVID-19, many volunteers had to stay longer due to the travel restrictions, with no one showing any interest to stay due to the uncertainty. During 2021, a number of volunteers have asked about remaining for either another year of volunteering and/or to secure employment. Unfortunately, due to the immigration restrictions, Camphill Blair Drummond is no longer able to offer this opportunity which is particularly frustrating at a time when the community is finding it increasingly difficult to recruit suitable social care employees”.</p> <p>Camphill Corbenic, Perth and Kinross</p> <p>“Camphill Corbenic is not currently set up as a sponsored UK employer offering visa licences. The community can, therefore, only employ European workers who already have</p>

the right to work in the UK, a fact which has significantly reduced the number of European workers eligible to apply. In addition, if Camphill Corbenic becomes a licenced employer offering sponsorship, applicants would need to meet the visa requirements (e.g. minimum qualifications and salary). Significantly, the salary required for a skilled worker is above the Scottish living wage. Being a sponsored employer also brings the associated duties and costs (e.g. admin costs and costs for licences). Camphill Corbenic has already had to decline applications from candidates who require sponsorship”.

Camphill School Aberdeen, Aberdeen City Council

“For volunteers the only real difference is the cost and time scale for the visa. This still does not deter people from coming, and applications EU wide are still coming in for August 2022. Camphill School Aberdeen has during 2021 been able to recruit German, Dutch, Georgian, Albanian, Swiss and Slovakian volunteers, which is more international than previous years when German volunteers accounted for around 98% of European volunteer arrivals within the community”.

Loch Arthur, Dumfries and Galloway

“Loch Arthur’s international volunteers will only be able to stay up to 12 months. Extending a visa into a second year has not been tried very often as the community anticipates that this would not be very easy. In the long-term, therefore, Loch Arthur will be unable to recruit long-term co-workers by volunteers staying on beyond their initial volunteer placement”.

Newton Dee, Aberdeen City Council

“Newton Dee has applied for a skilled worker licence, and this process remains ongoing. The community started this process in February 2021, had an inspection in August 2021 and has not yet been informed of the outcome. This leaves a number of people in limbo, and the uncertainty is a strain on the whole community”.

Simeon Care for the Elderly, Aberdeen City Council

“It is difficult for new EU applicants to apply due to the process, costs and risks involved in relocating to Scotland. The community anticipates it will end up with EU applicants applying from other care settings, which means fewer new staff will be available to help increase staffing numbers across Scotland”.

Tigh a’Chomainn Camphill, Aberdeen City Council

“While there are still people who want to come to Scotland the very negative and hostile press and political coverage in Westminster is already showing signs of eroding people’s wish to come to the UK”.

(b)The intentions of existing European staff to remain in post?

Beannachar, Aberdeenshire

“No staff have left because of Brexit to date. Though some EU staff have left with a heavy heart, knowing that due to immigration rules, returning may not be an option in future”.

Camphill Blair Drummond, Stirling

“Two of Camphill Blair Drummond’s EU employees have left its employment and returned to their home country. Both indicated that this was a direct result of Brexit”.

Camphill Corbenic, Perth and Kinross

“Camphill Corbenic is thankful that many of its European staff have remained in post. These staff have been with the community a long-time offering experience, skills and care qualifications. However, since COVID and Brexit Camphill Corbenic has lost some of its long term European staff”.

Camphill School Aberdeen, Aberdeen City Council

“For volunteers, as long as they have their EUSS all seems to be well, and they continue to stay/look for employment within the community. The community has had some 2021 volunteers asking to return to the community as they have secured EUSS status before the end of 2020”.

Loch Arthur, Dumfries and Galloway

“As such those staff members on the settlement scheme are fine. The community is not expecting existing people to leave because of Brexit”.

Newton Dee, Aberdeen City Council

“No difference as far as Newton Dee is aware”.

Ochil Tower School, Perth and Kinross

“So far very positive, no indication of them leaving”.

Simeon Care for the Elderly, Aberdeen City Council

“Depends on whether or not they have completed their EU settlement/Right to Work documents as required”.

Tigh a’Chomainn Camphill, Aberdeen City Council

“Increasingly feel alienated by the media messaging”.

(c) The ability of organisations/your community to fill vacancies?**Beannachar, Aberdeenshire**

“Recruitment is very difficult at all levels. Current vacancies are 4 basic support, 2 senior support, 2 team leaders, 1 service manager”.

Camphill Blair Drummond, Stirling

“Camphill Blair Drummond has always benefited from the rich cultural diversity of its EU volunteers over a long period of time. Those that remain after their 1 or 2 years’ volunteering experience, move onto positions of employment with Camphill Blair Drummond and remain for many years. This year alone, the community has had 3 enquires from its volunteers about staying on, or asking about employment. As the community cannot offer them these opportunities, it will need to fill vacancies solely from the local pool of people looking for work. In the last 15 years, it has never been able to recruit the best calibre of employees from just local recruitment rounds, and has always had to supplement these posts with its

EU volunteers. Now that this is no longer an option, Camphill Blair Drummond is acutely aware of the difficulties it faces in filling all of its vacancies. In 2021, the community had to advertise every other month, and it still has 5 vacancies to fill”.

“Vacancy levels increased significantly after the ending of lockdown in late Spring 2021, running at 18%. Some employees have held off moving on during the Covid-19 restrictions in 2020, and the community now finds itself with a higher turnover concentrated over a few months with the added challenge of no longer being able to recruit from its EU volunteers on site when there is also a marked reduction in applications from UK citizens for positions of employment– a perfect storm!”.

Camphill Corbenic, Perth and Kinross

“Camphill Corbenic is dealing with long standing challenges including issues around increased demand, funding restraints and workforce challenges such as attraction and retention plus the added issue of free movement”.

“Camphill Corbenic cannot compete with many other sectors with regards to salary offered. For example employees can get paid more stacking shelves in a supermarket, or as a cleaner, than they will do working as a support worker”.

“The community will need to consider investing more in terms of recruitment, marketing and promotion. It will have to look at creative ways to encourage staff to consider a job in adult social care. In short, Camphill Corbenic must find ways to adapt to the care worker shortage and fill vacancies”.

Camphill School Aberdeen, City of Aberdeen Council

“Given the uptake in volunteering requests locally, there is a potentially untapped staff base at our fingertips. This year has seen a few volunteers (not just from EU countries, but locally) move to employment, which is a positive outcome”.

Loch Arthur, Dumfries and Galloway

“As indicated above, it is difficult for Loch Arthur to recruit long term community members”.

Newton Dee, City of Aberdeen Council

“Newton Dee is worried about the inability of first year co-worker volunteers to stay on longer, now that they also require a Tier 5 volunteer visa. Newton Dee wishes that there was a legal mechanism for people to extend their time as volunteers in the community. This could, for example, be facilitated by extending the Tier 5 visa beyond 12 months.

Ochil Tower School, Perth and Kinross

“Struggling to recruit staff”.

Simeon Care for the Elderly, City of Aberdeen Council

“Making an already challenging task even harder! Simeon Care for the Elderly’s residents are of various nationalities, and having a staff team to reflect this makes a big difference to inclusion, understanding beliefs and traditions. The community is concerned that it will potentially lose some of what makes it unique!”.

Tigh a’Chomainn Camphill, City of Aberdeen Council

	<p>“Hard to fill vacancies with suitable candidates”.</p>
<p>3.</p>	<p>Over the medium term, i.e. in around five years’ time, what, if any, differences would you expect to see in the sector/within your community as a result of the end of free movement?</p> <p>Beannachar, Aberdeenshire “A less diverse workforce, a smaller pool of potential workers to progress and grow in the organisation”.</p> <p>Camphill Blair Drummond, Stirling “Whist the current ‘perfect storm’ noted above will ease, the loss of EU volunteers extending their stay and moving into employment will curtail the wider cultural pool of employees that adds to the vibrancy of Camphill Blair Drummond’s workforce and organisation. It has also found that young (18-25 year olds) EU volunteers who remain and secure employment with the community, are more likely to remain committed and stay with it for longer periods than their equivalent UK employees of a similar age. This stability is so important when providing excellent social care to vulnerable people who rely on consistency from people they know and trust”.</p> <p>Camphill Corbenic, Perth and Kinross “Camphill Corbenic will need to offer UK visa sponsorship as part of its recruitment plan. It will need to review staff salaries to compete with other sectors, and to aid staff retention. The care sector will need to offer more attractive terms and conditions including employee benefits to both attract and retain staff”.</p> <p>“Camphill Corbenic expects to see less European workers within the community, which is a great shame as it identifies as a diverse and multicultural community”.</p> <p>“There is a shortage of workers prepared to work in care”.</p> <p>Camphill School Aberdeen, City of Aberdeen Council “More UK based volunteers will be required for certain. Camphill School Aberdeen cannot comment about EEA/non-EEA volunteer numbers as these change on a yearly basis, and were doing so even before Brexit and COVID-19”.</p> <p>Loch Arthur, Dumfries and Galloway “As previously mentioned above, volunteers cannot stay on, and make the community their home. Loch Arthur is concerned that this might in the long-term undermine how its members live together, if there are no new co-workers coming into the community”.</p> <p>Newton Dee, City of Aberdeen Council “That will depend entirely upon whether or not the community receives the skilled worker visa licence. If not, Newton Dee will have difficulties maintaining the co-worker model in the long-term. Having to use a skilled worker visa, and the employed model, to retain talent will have a financial effect and also make it harder to uphold the Camphill ethos for the community”.</p> <p>Ochil Tower School, Perth and Kinross</p>

	<p>“Increasing difficulties in recruiting staff”.</p> <p>Simeon Care for the Elderly, City of Aberdeen Council</p> <p>“Investment from government as it will appreciate the sector and support employers and voluntary agencies with additional funding to reflect the commitment of employees”.</p> <p>“Reduction of volunteer numbers as more paperwork, unfair immigration interviews and personal costs take effect. There has also been a reduction in the number of EU employees”.</p> <p>Tigh a’ Chomainn Camphill, City of Aberdeen Council</p> <p>“Very hard to maintain the international aspect. Poor quality local skills. Not enough people to run service well. Tigh a’ Chomainn Camphill needs EU nationals regardless of whether they are employed or volunteers in order to run a quality service”.</p>
<p>4.</p>	<p>Are there any ways in which location impacts on staffing and recruitment in the social care sector, for example, travel times, accessibility, or local population demographics?</p> <p>Beannachar, Aberdeenshire</p> <p>“Aberdeen is historically an expensive area to live in due to the oil and gas industry. The recent down turn in this sector has had limited impact on recruitment into social care. The wages for social care staff do not reflect the unsocial hours, responsibly and skills needed in a social care workforce, and generally reflect that this sector is undervalued”.</p> <p>Camphill Blair Drummond, Stirling</p> <p>“Everyone needs access to a car, as the local bus service runs once per hour, and stops after 5pm on a Sunday!”</p> <p>“With the Scottish Government only funding wages to the Living Wage now for all Social Care staff, it is more a challenge to be competitive with salaries. As such, all providers now pay the Living Wage (which is a good thing), however, funding is insufficient for Camphill Blair Drummond to pay higher salaries to attract employees, and/or address the additional costs they will incur over and above those if working in Stirling with another provider”.</p> <p>Camphill Corbenic, Perth and Kinross</p> <p>“Camphill Corbenic is a rural community not served by public transport, which can be a barrier for prospective employees who do not drive, or do not have access to a car. The rural nature of the site may be off putting for job seekers due to winter travel conditions. The prolonged road works on the A9 increased travel time for many employees, which may also have put off prospective employees”.</p> <p>“Also, Camphill Corbenic is an international community, and many employees need to relocate when they start to work with the community. Camphill Corbenic is aware that Perthshire is a very expensive place in which to live, and that there is a shortage of affordable accommodation options within the local area which can further hamper recruitment”.</p>

“Lastly, it is much easier to recruit when you are in a city or large town where you have access to large numbers of job seekers and also a student population who are attracted to relief care posts”.

Camphill School Aberdeen, City of Aberdeen Council

“Many volunteers found their local Visa Application Centres (VACs) had long processing delays, if they were open e.g. India had only 4 out of 8 VACS running, while Georgia’s VAC had a 2 months’ processing delay. Against this background, volunteers sometimes had to travel out of their region/state/country to find a VAC that was open, and which did not have a long processing delay”.

Loch Arthur, Dumfries and Galloway

“We have always had difficulties to recruit social care workers from the local area due to Loch Arthur being in a rural area, and the perception amongst some potential volunteers and employees that it is worth ‘coming out’ for some hours at the time. There would need to be more full-time contracts to make it worthwhile for someone”.

Newton Dee, Aberdeen, City of Aberdeen Council

“Newton Dee still finds it puzzling that it hardly receives any applications from within the UK for volunteering. Otherwise the community has not had any issues around location, but maybe that is because there is a regular bus service very close to Newton Dee”.

Ochil Tower School, Auchterarder, Perth and Kinross

“The community is half an hour’s drive from the two nearest towns, which does have an impact on recruitment”.

Simeon Care for the Elderly, Aberdeen, City of Aberdeen Council

“Public Transport could be improved”.

“Local competition, other care homes are all recruiting, with some offering higher salaries and greater employee benefits. There is also an ageing population and workforce. Other professions are more attractive, e.g. Oil & Gas, Beauty Therapy, Fitness etc. In addition, the community is located in an affluent area where many people do not need to work. There is also a bit of a postcode lottery with regards to availability of childcare, which can impact upon recruitment”.

Tigh a’ Chomainn Camphill, Aberdeen, City of Aberdeen Council

“Skills base, willingness of people to engage in a challenging working environment in unique ways and creative ways”.

5. Any other Comments?:

Camphill Corbenic, Perth and Kinross

“HR teams have had to navigate their way through the short and medium-term implications of Brexit, especially as their effects on HR policy and practice become clearer. Furthermore, the pandemic added further implications for management staff who had to implement government guidelines within practice”.

“High turnover of staff due to COVID-19, Brexit and other pressures faced by care workers results in higher costs in terms of time and money spent on recruitment and training which further hits the care sector and charities alike”.

“Understaffing caused by covid absences and inability to fill vacancies has also put substantial pressure on Corbenic and the care staff, as they work hard to cover gaps. This working environment cannot be sustained for prolonged periods as it can easily cause dissatisfaction and stress amongst workers, and can result in time off work due to stress or resignation”.

Simeon Care for the Elderly, Aberdeen, City of Aberdeen Council

“Reputation - an organisation’s reputation can help attract quality employees, having a setting where people want to work can make up for other aspects – salary, working hours, employee benefits. Having professional registrations to maintain can help individuals chose a lower paid post over higher paid organisations with poor quality or reputation. If Simeon Care for the Elderly can continue to enhance its reputation, be the best it can be, individuals will want to work with the community!”.